

OCT 17 1905

11-

the offices, and, in that connection, let me say that a good deal has been said about the fact that there are three or four offices to be held in the county government which might be filled by yourselves. It has been intimated, indeed, that this is the reason why the lawyers have filed in the bill.

I think that, from the earliest time;- going back again to the Declaration of Independence, it has been the lawyers who have led the wealth of the community. Coming now to arguments in favor of the bill, the present speaker has pointed out a number of them;- that, as a county government, we stand as an incorporated part of the city of New York, and yet not subject to another court; that we are then treated as if coming from the county of New York, that we stand equal to the county of New York.

Moreover, we are now only represented by only one-half a senator, whose energies must necessarily be divided, and two assemblymen, only one of which is elected within the lines of the Borough. Were we to become a separate county, we would be entitled to one more senator and one more assemblyman than we are now entitled to as a portion of the County of New York. Is not that in itself a sufficient inducement for the establishment of the county, this giving us an additional voice in the legislature of the state of New York? It seems a small amount but it represents a great deal. It is true that we are to have an attorney and two or three more assemblymen. But if we had five, we would be no better off. We need the extra Senator.

I do not think it is particularly wise for the Board to take a position of ultra-conservatism that it has held up to the present time. Let us go back to the time mentioned by the last speaker-1873. For a period of 17 years, we made no progress, so there

OCT 17 1905

12-

was nothing that brought the Bronx Board to notice. Let us ask every member of this Board if he recalls when we first began to made progress? When did our remarkable progress start? From the time we divorced ourselves from the County of New York!

Another aspect may be pointed out in favor of the bill: Is it not sufficient to say that with a county government here, with a supreme court judge on the bench immediately in your neighborhood that that man would not have lost his right to franchise? Is not that in itself worth a county government? I will not mention again the advantages of speedy trials except to point out that many a plaintiff has been defeated in legal action because of the fact that during the three or four years, the case had been pending a witness died, whose testimony was indispensable. I ask you, gentlemen, if after the arguments put forth, you can deny the justice of the attitude taken, and if you do not consider it a worthy one to take?"

Mr. Hottemroth:-"I simply wish to add a word or two in this direction; that is, to call your attention to the fact that since the passage of the resolution in 1904 by this Board (which some hereto-night seem to think forecloses all future action or discussion based on the subject of such vital importance), that the matter has been discussed everywhere else in this Borough of the Bronx, and the action taken by other bodies of citizens as interested in the Bronx as ourselves, has led to the discussion of the matter as a measure in the Legislature of 1905. From an intelligent and progressive standpoint, the bill that was introduced in 1905, after thorough discussion, was reported favorable by a judicial commission and "The Sun". All this has tendered toward the consummation and successful passing of the bill. If this Board is

OCT 17 1905

13-

to take the stand that there is no progress to be illustrated by the action of the Board, then the Board stands for stagnation in the Bronx, instead of for the interests of the Bronx. In that case, I fail to unstand the purpose of its creation, or the purpose of its present existence. We stand here for progress, and this bill means progress! It was reported favorable, so it can be put as a measure by a committee in the Bar Association by the Borough of the Bronx. A committee that is not supreme in this Borough nor in this city, will be of no use for the purpose for which it is appointed, no matter who the gentlemen are that compose it. Messrs A. C. H., L. A. Va., Arthur C. are all well known to you, and to those interested in the Bronx as a whole. They have all the necessary qualifications and combine with them the advantage of being active in the profession. The bill be again be introduced as a measure before the Bar Association, and, gentlemen, it represents the interests of all merchants in the the Bronx of all classes. Gentlemen, fight for this measure. Do, if it takes all summer, this year, next year or no matter how many years, until the Borough of the Bronx is put in the place where it belongs."

Senator Hawkins:- (First part left out) "Why they laughed at us up there. They told us they were willing to give us anything that we were willing to pay for. As if we did not pay our share for everything we got! The reason the Bronx is kept a Borough is that it is helping now by its beinf taxed to pay for the erection of public buildings in New York. Her money is going into public court-houses . We are paying our share to-day (1/2 million of dollars) and we do not get a room as small as a hall bedroom without paying for it. Now, in the latter of the benefit to be derived from the creation of the borough into a county, as far as

OCT 17 1905

14-

legal matters are concerned: It is not necessary to tell anybody how great an advantage it would be, especially after the arguments already put forth. There is another point, gentlemen, to which I would like to call the attention of both parties: when they created the "Local Improvement Association", he was not elected by opposing parties, he was elected by the people, and the man who will stand in the way of questions of this kind, that will effects the interests of the Borough, is not competent to hold the office and a responsible person should be elected in his place. Why, when the delegation went up from here to Albany, it was not made up of any special party, but when they got up there, it was by the cooperation of the members, it was by hard and quick work, earnestness and sincerity that the bill was put through; and at that it was not signed until the last night on which it could be signed, and it was only signed then because the delegation had not slept during the 30 days that this bill lay asleep on the desk of the Committee. We want this bill passed that we may be just as good as any other community in the City of New York. If Queens can have such a government, we are entitled to it also, and to the advantages consequent upon it."

Dr. Close:-"I think this is the first time I have ever been on your floor. I am not a lawyer, and speak as a individual member. I have lived in the Borough many many years, and I have known many hardships in being called down to the lawyer in the borough of Manhattan in court cases. I have spent days and days of valuable time, which could have been saved by our having our own courts located in the Borough of the Bronx. I presume it likely that every physician living here appreciates that fact and I came here entirely unprejudiced. I really feel that it would be for

the interest of the Bronx to have a separate county and to have all our courts located here in the Bronx. I know physicians do not have their offices down town. Many lawyers so, and I believe it will be more advantageous to the Borough of the Bronx if we were to have our business offices here. I am in favor of having a separate county, and, while I was previously a little in favor of the other way, I feel to-night that I would like to have the resolution stand."

Mr. W. Stebbins Smith:-"I have been "on the fence" in this matter for a long time. I have looked at it upon both sides, and could not come to a decision. I have been an old resident here as many know, and I am interested in the progress of the Borough, and anything that tends to increase that progress. It seems to me that, upon a fair consideration, (outside of any political feeling, outside of any personal feeling of advantages to be gained) that for the general good of the Borough, we should have a separate county. I do not believe we are willing to give up anything that we have acquired in our progress thus far. We are only too glad to have this opportunity to have a county government, which, it seems to me, will be for the general good of the public at large. When the suggestion was made that we have a separate county, there was very little objection to it. Now who wishes it changed? I feel that we should have a certain amount of pride in this matter and not belittle ourselves. It seems to me that it is a matter of progress that is bound to come sooner or later, and the sooner the better. In looking at it from a purely impersonal standpoint, that it will be for the good of this community if the Borough is created a separate county and divorced from the county of New York."

OCT 17 1905

16-

Mr. Wells-"I shall not detain this audience very long for several reasons: first, because I am a lay man and ofcourse, (according to the arguments that have been presented here) know nothing; and consequently have very little understanding before the Board. I am so ignorant (according to the insinuations that have been given of laymen here) that I am unable to read the laws governing the Borough of the Bronx. I have ^{lived} in the Borough of the Bronx for thirty years, and still have the misfortune of not being called a lawyer. I did believe that I had some faults; consequently, I cannot agree with the people advocating this measure, because, from their standpoint, they are absolutely right, and everyone disagreeing with them in absolutely wrong. Their minds are made up, and the old saying holds good:—"A man convinced against his will, will be of the same opinion still." My friend Van doren, states that there were no arguments whatever upon the subject, and then he spends a full half hour, by your watch in announcing what he says were the arguments presented. Then he spends overtime in announcing arguments that were not presented. I will not seek to detain you longer, gentlemen, as my opinion has not changed with regard to this bill from the beginning. I still think that the measure is unconstitutional, unwise and that it will be a serious disadvantage to the Bronx. I claim to have been and to be a friend of the Bronx. I have done as much, if not more, than some of those who are now denouncing men either by direct reference, or by innuendos, as being enemies of the Bronx because they differed from them with regard to this subject. I am willing to tell you gentlemen, and I am and have always been ready to discuss in a friendly and decent manner, any matter that concerns the progress of the Bronx, and there is no man in this

OCT 17 1905

17-

room, sir, that will go further toward helping to accomplish even what is asked in this measure than I, if I can be convinced that it is for the welfare of the Bronx.

Mr. Davis:- "When I learned that there was to be a special meeting, called for the purpose of discussing the Bronx County project, remembering how much that project had been discussed by the Board during the three terms of my administration as President, I wondered what emergency was to bring together these members only one week ahead of the regular meeting of the Board. I wondered what new arguments were discovered. I was curious to know why a special meeting was necessary when there was no session in the legislature, no particular reason in the world why this matter could not have been discussed at the regular. I was present at the October meeting, and I am frank to say, Mr. President, that I have not heard any new arguments here to-night. I will quote the words of a lawyer (letter read). I will read letter from the members of the Board---men who have done much to bring the Borough up to the highest point and so forth (letters read). The arguments was advanced here repeatedly that the development of the Bronx began with the establishment of _____ in 1891, and that, therefore, the establishment of a county government here would create a similar effect. There is a vast difference between the two. Will anybody say that if you and I have a case in court it is going to be tested according to legal ideas? The law would not be affected in the least by having a county government here. It has been stated that there is a great congestion in the courts so that we might suppose that the Bronx was suffering tremendously on that account, and that it was a disadvantage to everyone who had a case in courts. Is there any discrimination made between the

OCT 17 1905

18-

Bronx and the Manhattan cases?"

Mr. Van Doren:-" Mr. President, another of the advocates of the county project brought up a question of a man losing his franchise to vote. I cut this out of this morning's "Tribune" (Clippin read). Mr. President, I think enough has been said on this subject to convince almost anyone outside of the legal profession, and I may say anyone of the legal profession, who have their offices outside of the Bronx, that we should become a county of New York and have a county government.

J. Clarence Davies-"Mr. President and Gentlemen:-Some two years ago, I was appointed a committee by this Board to attend a hearing at Albany, to oppose for this Board the bill making the Bronx a separate county. In trying to do my duty of opposing the measure at Albany, I followed the orders of the Board, and went very thoroughly into the subject, and presented a mass of facts to the Committee at Albany. I do not recall all those facts to-day, but what I can recall, Gentlemen, I will try to enumerate. The real estate man knows that the basis of value for real estate is the amount of money he can obtain on mortgaging the property. If you cannot borrow money on the property, it is worth nothing. Knowing that to be a fact, and supposing that I might be prejudiced, I went downtown to the loaners of money in these districts. I went to the large law-firms first, and then I went to the Title Guarantee Companies, which lend many sums each year for the development of building loans, to get their opinion on the subject. Without exception, I was told that, if the Bronx was made a separate county, they would not be inclined to make building loans or premium loans in this section whatever. They might make exceptions, but they would certainly withdraw some of their loans

and not make any in the future. I asked for this in black and white, and I obtained from the Title Guarantee Company a letter to that effect. I obtained the same letter from Mr. Cogshell of the Lawyers Title & Guarantee Co.. I can enumerate, perhaps, a dozen banks of the title companies who lent largely at that time, and who do at the present time in the Bronx, who would withdraw those loans and be very careful about making any more in the Bronx if it became a separate county. I then went to the large estates (mentioned some). Without an exception, I found they were opposed to making a separate county of the Bronx. They said one reason why the Bronx property was good was the fact that it was a part of New York County. Explain it how you will, the fact still remains. Right here on Third Avenue, we got as high as \$50,000. to \$60,000. for a lot; over in Brooklyn, right at the bridge (and that is the best part of Brooklyn) they hardly reach these figures. These are facts, which you cannot get around. Say what you will, the fact still remains that the Bronx has made its greatest progress by being part of the County of New York.

Well, gentlemen, we are, as you know, part of the greatest county of the United States, - a county from which we got all the money to develop this Borough, to develop this part of the city. We got our money for our buildings, we got our money for our mortgages, we got people to buy our real estate (for 90% of our customers are people who live in Manhattan and come up here to buy our real estate), from Manhattan. Now what on earth do we want to divouse ourselves from the very place that has done us so much good and that is going to make our future for us? Furthermore, the thing might be carried further:- Washington Heights should have its own county government there, to use the same

20-

argument. The fact that we would have more offices to elect, would have a county court here, and would be able to get our cases tried quickly, are absurd. Gentlemen, if you had courts right here, in the Borough of the Bronx, it would not be three or four years before you would have the same delay in the borough of the Bronx as you now have in Manhattan. You have an enormous county, enormous money and what you want to make yourselves a little county for, and divorce yourselves from Manhattan, is more than I understand. I want to say that I want to do all that I can to boost the real estate interest in the Bronx. If for one moment I saw that I could make my property better by 5% by making this a separate county, I would certainly be in favor of it. If I thought it would be better for the Bronx to be a separate county, there is no one who would be more in favor of making it such than myself. By being a part of New York County, the Bronx has progressed, and, if it becomes separated, it will go back and become what Brooklyn property was, three or four years ago. I certainly hope that this resolution will not materialize, as I feel that the Borough of the Bronx would suffer greatly should the bill go through."

Mr. Hottenroth: "What are the letters from which Mr. Davis recites?"

Mr. Davis: "Received from the various Title Companies opposing the separation. They are at the disposition of the Board."

Alfred B. Hall:- "Gentlemen, I am neither a lawyer, a doctor or layman, but an ordinary citizen. I have lived in the Bronx fifty-three years, and have been interested somewhat in real estate. To go into ancient history some thirty years ago, we were part of Westchester County and we were not satisfied to be that, so what did we do but ask to become part of New York County.